



# Draft Submission

## Standards and Guidelines for CEO Recruitment and Selection, Performance Review and Termination

**October 2019**

## About WALGA

The WA Local Government Association (WALGA) is working for Local Government in Western Australia. As the peak industry body, WALGA advocates on behalf of 138 Western Australian Local Governments. As the united voice of Local Government in Western Australia, WALGA is an independent, membership-based organisation representing and supporting the work and interests of Local Governments in Western Australia. WALGA provides an essential voice for 1,222 Elected Members, approximately 22,000 Local Government employees (16,500 Full Time Equivalent's) as well as over 2.5 million constituents of Local Governments in Western Australia.

## Contacts

Tony Brown  
Executive Manager Governance and Organisational Services  
(08) 9213 2029      [tbrown@walga.asn.au](mailto:tbrown@walga.asn.au)

Tim Lane  
Manager Association Governance and Strategy  
(08) 9213 2029      [tlane@walga.asn.au](mailto:tlane@walga.asn.au)

James McGovern  
Manager Governance  
(08) 9213 2093      [jmcgovern@walga.asn.au](mailto:jmcgovern@walga.asn.au)

Emma Clements  
Employee Relations Service Manager  
(08) 9213 2014      [eclements@walga.asn.au](mailto:eclements@walga.asn.au)

## Contents

<b>About WALGA</b> .....	<b>2</b>
Contacts .....	2
<b>Background</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>General Comments – Philosophical Approach</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>Specific Feedback</b> .....	<b>6</b>
Re-advertising the Position after 10 Years.....	6
Selection Panel – Independent Person.....	6
Creating Diversity Section .....	7
Independent Review of Termination Report.....	7
<b>Feedback on Consultation Questions</b> .....	<b>7</b>
Recruitment and Selection.....	7
Performance Review .....	8
Termination .....	8
Monitoring and Enforcement.....	8
Guidelines .....	9

## Background

The *Local Government Legislation Amendment Act 2019* will introduce new requirements in relation to CEO recruitment, performance and termination (Sections 5.39A and 5.39B).

The Department of Local Government, Sport and Cultural Industries have released a draft document – *Standards and Guidelines for Local Government CEO Recruitment and Selection, Performance Review and Termination* – for consultation.

While WALGA and other invited parties participated in a working group to develop the document, the draft was released without WALGA's endorsement and there are a number of concerns with the draft that will be expanded upon in this submission. WALGA appreciates the opportunity afforded to participate in the working group process and to make a submission on the draft document.

The Department of Local Government, Sport and Cultural Industries is seeking feedback on the draft document by 6 December 2019. It is important that Local Governments also make submissions to the Department on this draft document to ensure the sector's views are received.

WALGA is seeking feedback on this draft submission by 25 October 2019. WALGA's submission, which will be updated following sector feedback, will then be included in the December State Council Agenda for consideration at November Zone meetings, before being considered at the 4 December meeting of State Council.

## General Comments – Philosophical Approach

WALGA's fundamental guiding principle is that democratically elected Councils are competent, and should be empowered to undertake their role of governing the Local Government's affairs. This is articulated in WALGA's Strategic Plan, which outlines the vision for Local Government as follows:

*Local Governments will be built on good governance, autonomy, local leadership, democracy, community engagement and diversity.*

WALGA's perspective is that Councils should be empowered to do the job they've been entrusted by the community in democratic elections to do. This includes responsibility for employment of a Chief Executive Officer. Further, WALGA believes that the correct approach is to build the capacity of Councils to undertake this function through the provision of professional services, advice and support, and training.

This is not to downplay the challenges associated with employing and managing a Chief Executive Officer. It is fully acknowledged that this one of Council's most challenging tasks.

Given Council has only one employee – the Chief Executive Officer – it is crucial that the Council makes an informed decision when employing a CEO, and has the processes in place to effectively manage the performance of the CEO. As Councillors are often community representatives, who may not be experienced or qualified in contemporary human resource management practices, employment, management and performance appraisal of the CEO may be one of the Council's most significant challenges.

The *Local Government Act 1995* requires that performance criteria for the purpose of reviewing the CEO's performance are established. Similarly, development of these performance criteria are crucial for the Council to get right.

For these reasons, WALGA offers an Elected Member training course on CEO Performance Appraisals, and provides Elected Members with significant advice and assistance through the CEO recruitment and performance appraisal cycle.

WALGA also recommends that Councils engage a specialised recruitment consultant to assist Councils manage the recruitment process.

The development of guidelines to assist Councils through the Chief Executive Officer employment cycle is supported in principle. However, WALGA believes the approach should be based on capacity building, guidance and support, and help where necessary; not based on the development of rules that create a compliance regime which may create uncertainty, unnecessary administration and risk for Local Governments and Chief Executive Officers.

## Specific Feedback

WALGA has concerns relating to some specific aspects of the draft document. These concerns are outlined below.

### Re-advertising the Position after 10 Years

It is unclear why there is a need for the position of Chief Executive Officer to be advertised after 10 years as a matter of course.

If the Council and the Chief Executive Officer are satisfied with the employment relationship, then forcing the position to be advertised will be disruptive, time-consuming, expensive, and counter-productive for the Local Government. Further, it will create uncertainty for the CEO who may be forced to look for alternative employment 'just in case'.

In addition, if the performance management process is undertaken correctly and thoroughly, there should not be any need for the position to be advertised after a timeframe specified in regulations.

Lastly, as Chief Executive Officers are on fixed term contracts, Councils already have the opportunity to consider whether to renew the incumbent's contract.

WALGA's view is that this requirement should be removed from the guidelines, and not included in regulations.

### Selection Panel – Independent Person

It is unclear why an independent person should be included on the selection panel that makes recommendations to Council about the employment of a Chief Executive Officer.

Employment of the Chief Executive Officer is a fundamental role of Council. Including others on the selection panel risks creating uncertainty and ambiguity about the employment relationship.

The requirement to have an independent person on the selection panel is also impractical and may cause processes and decisions to become protracted. There is no guarantee that the independent person will have knowledge or experience in recruitment, Local Government processes, or Local Government Act requirements. This requirement could also add an unnecessary and unreasonable cost to the recruitment process, particularly for Councils in remote locations.

WALGA fully supports and encourages Councils to utilise a qualified recruitment consultant to guide Councils through the process of recruiting a CEO, but this person would not be a decision-making member of the selection panel.

## Creating Diversity Section

WALGA contends that this section should be renamed “Sound Decision Making”, as this is what this section is primarily about.

It is acknowledged that unconscious biases can be a factor in decision making and building awareness of these biases in the guidelines is supported.

## Independent Review of Termination Report

WALGA acknowledges that decisions and rationale relating to termination need to be documented. The principle that Councils should seek advice from an employee relations or legal advisor when terminating the CEO is acknowledged and supported.

It is not clear that requiring independent review of a termination report adds value. Rather, it will add unnecessary administrative time and risk into the decision making process.

## Feedback on Consultation Questions

WALGA provides the following feedback in response to the consultation survey questions.

### Recruitment and Selection

*Question 12 – How frequently should a council be required to re-advertise the CEO position?*

Council, as the employer, should determine when the position of CEO is advertised.

*Question 13 – To what extent do you support that Local Governments should be required to undertake ‘blind CV recruitment’?*

It is acknowledged that ‘blind CV recruitment’ could be a useful tool in some circumstances, but it should not be a requirement. In addition, in the Western Australian Local Government sector, blind CV recruitment would be almost practically impossible because the applicant’s previous employment experience would mean that they would be identifiable. That is, if an applicant listed “CEO at the Shire of \_\_\_\_\_”, their identity could be determined with a very quick internet search.

*Questions 14-17 – Independent Selection Panel Members*

The requirement to have an independent member on the selection panel is not supported.

## Performance Review

*Question 18 – How frequently should a Council review the performance of the CEO?*

There is no rationale for why the current annual requirement is unsatisfactory. Clearly, a Council may have reasons to formally review the CEO's performance more frequently than the minimum annual requirement, and as such, the Council should have the discretion to do so.

*Questions 19-21 – Independent Person on Performance Review Panel*

It is unclear how an independent person on a performance review panel would add any value to the process, given an independent person may have limited knowledge about the CEO's recent performance.

In fact, having a person not involved in the employment relationship involved in the performance review process seems to be contrary to a fair and proper performance review process.

WALGA fully supports Councils utilising an experienced and qualified consultant to facilitate the performance review process, but not to contribute to the substance of the performance review.

## Termination

*Questions 22 and 23 – Termination Notice Periods*

It is noted that notice periods must comply with the National Employment Standards. There needs to be compliance with employment law at a minimum and, as the role of CEO is a senior position, a greater notice period (in the order of three months) is appropriate.

## Monitoring and Enforcement

*Questions 24-30 – Monitoring and Enforcement*

As outlined in the general comments section above, WALGA's preferred approach is one based on capacity building, advice and support, and training.

A compliance based approach undermines the intent of having guidelines to assist Local Governments in their decision making processes, and may lead to risks and unintended consequences.

The consultation questions seem to imply that costs that result from consequences stemming from breaching the standards would be borne by the Local Government: for example, if the



process needed to be redone or there was a dispute. Establishment of a compliance and enforcement framework of this nature seems to be unnecessarily putting public money at risk.

WALGA acknowledges that the CEO recruitment process needs to be undertaken properly, and legally, and it is for these reasons that WALGA is advocating for a capacity building approach, with Councils encouraged to engage professional services and advice to ensure the process is undertaken properly.

*Question 25 – To what extent do you support the statement: If a Local Government Commissioner were to be established, local governments should be required to pay a levy to fund its establishment and operation?*

This appears to be a new idea without any supporting information as to the powers, duties and role of a Local Government Commissioner, and is therefore not something that WALGA can support at this stage.

The idea that Local Governments should be levied to fund an apparatus of the State Government is not supported. This would represent a significant cost shift from the State Government to the Local Government sector, for what appears to be a core regulatory role of the Department of Local Government, Sport and Cultural Industries.

## **Guidelines**

*Questions 31-33 – Utility of the guidelines*

In general, there is useful information in the guidelines that will be of assistance to Councils embarking on a CEO recruitment process. As argued in this submission, WALGA's perspective is that the approach should be based on capacity building, support, advice, and training, and not based on a compliance driven approach.